Using Family Violence Data to Build Support for Prevention

Kenneth Steinman, PhD, MPH
Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project
ofvpp@cph.osu.edu  614.292.3373

Elder Justice Workshop
Area Agency on Aging 3, Lima, Ohio
October 19, 2010
Outline

Overview
• What is “family violence” data?
• Why should I use data?

Family Violence Data in Ohio
• Sources
• Findings

How to use data
• Grant-writing/Advocacy
• Planning/Evaluation
• Highlighted themes

Discussion/Q&A
What is Family Violence Data?
Information about the risk factors for, scope of, and consequences of family violence in Ohio.

• child maltreatment
• intimate partner violence
• elder maltreatment (EM)
Two Principles

1. Keep it local
   - county
2 principles

1. Keep it local
   - county

2. Put it in context
   - Compared to what?
Context

• Period
  – How does my county compare to last year?

• Place
  – How does my county compare to others?

• Problem
  – How does elder maltreatment compare to other problems in my county?
Why Use Data?
I didn’t have any accurate numbers so I just made up this one.

Studies have shown that accurate numbers aren’t any more useful than the ones you make up.

How many studies showed that?

Eighty-seven.
I don't care what the research says, we need to do [X]!

The study's not valid because it didn't include women who didn't seek help.

You can get statistics to say anything you want.

The study's not valid because it didn't include Latinas.

Quantitative studies suppress victims' voices.

The study's not valid because it didn't include emotional abuse.

I don't care what the research says, we need to do [X]!

The numbers don't capture what's really going on here.

I'm afraid to use statistics because I don't really get them.

I've helped fill out the forms these data are based on. I know they're flawed.
Why don’t we use data?

• Every source is imperfect
  – especially for complex issues like FV

• Different “case” definitions
  – fear of undercounting

• Difficult to find and report
  – Access local level data
  – Skills to report findings accurately
So - Why bother...?

• “If you don’t count it, it doesn’t count”
  – others use data

• “the numbers favor elder maltreatment”

• Builds credibility
Family Violence Data in Ohio: Sources
Sources of elder maltreatment data

• Surveillance
  – Ohio Family Health Survey (OFHS): physical IPV
  – National Elder Mistreatment Study

• Agency reports
  – Adult protective services (ODJFS)
  – SRI’s in LTC facilities (ODH/AGO)
Public Health Surveillance

the ongoing, systematic collection, analysis, interpretation, and dissemination of data regarding a health-related event for use in public health action to reduce morbidity and mortality and to improve health

Examples

• Cancer registries (OCISS)
• Vital statistics
• Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System
• Ohio Violent Death Reporting System
• Nothing on elder maltreatment
Why no elder maltreatment surveillance?

• Conceptual/legal definitions vary
  – Emotional abuse
  – Neglect
  – Self-neglect

• No “gold standard” measure

• Paucity of research
How Common?

• National Elder Maltreatment Study (2010)
  – Self-report telephone survey
  – 11% annual incidence

• National Elder Abuse Incidence Study (1998)
  – Sentinel surveillance
  – 1%

• Other studies
  – 2-10% annual incidence
Underlying Prevalence

- Cases that come to authorities’ attention and those that do not.

- Interpolated from national data
  - assumes Ohio is similar to US average
  - assumes each county is similar to US average

- Range reflects uncertainty
Agency Reports

• Adult protective service reports

• Self-reported incidents in LTC facilities

• Only those cases that come to our attention
  – 7 - 20% of all cases?
Adult Protective Service Reports

• All 88 counties since SFY 2005-6
• Available by county
• Report ≠ individual
“Self-Reported Incidents” in long term care facilities

- LTC facilities must reported any allegations of abuse/neglect/exploitation
- Each year, about 8,000 “SRI’s” reported to Ohio Department of Health
- ~ 3,100 referred to Medicaid Fraud Control Unit (AGO)
  - ~ 300 investigations
  - ~ 30 cases/convictions
  - tallies available by county
Family Violence Data in Ohio: Findings

These data describe common types of violence perpetrated by family members or caregivers in our state each year. We present the best available, most recent estimates. Nonetheless, our figures are conservative and represent only part of the burden family violence places on our families and communities. All figures are estimates or annual averages.

Each year in our state...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Estimate 1</th>
<th>Estimate 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children abused or neglected</td>
<td>38,000 – 56,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse or neglect filed</td>
<td>105,245</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniors abused, neglected or exploited</td>
<td>90,000 – 115,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation filed for seniors</td>
<td>6,900 – 13,700</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children placed in custody</td>
<td>26,853</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse and neglect</td>
<td>18,822</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation filed for seniors</td>
<td>7,530</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults placed in custody</td>
<td>3,998</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation filed for seniors</td>
<td>3,163</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adults seek shelter</td>
<td>21,800</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation filed for seniors</td>
<td>26,853</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- It is difficult to measure the true prevalence of family violence; many victims never come to the attention of authorities.

- Reports to local children’s service agencies typically exceed the estimated number of abused or neglected children. This is likely due to multiple reports filed for a single child. Also, many children are placed in custody for reasons other than abuse or neglect (e.g., delinquency).

- Elder abuse/neglect figures exclude self-neglect and victims <60 years old. (LTC = long term care)
In Ohio, how does family violence compare to other threats among ...?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teenage girls (age 15-19, est. #/year)</th>
<th>Adult women (age 18+, est. #/year)</th>
<th>Seniors (age 60+, est. #/year)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cigarette use</td>
<td>Physical intimate partner violence</td>
<td>Injuries from falls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67,000 - 118,000</td>
<td>56,000 – 78,000</td>
<td>66,000 – 128,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dating violence</td>
<td>Motor vehicle crash injuries</td>
<td>Elder abuse/neglect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32,000 – 49,000</td>
<td>51,007</td>
<td>90,000 – 115,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pregnancies</td>
<td>Mothers without 1st trimester prenatal care</td>
<td>New cancer cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26,228</td>
<td>42,900</td>
<td>40,289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motor vehicle crash injuries</td>
<td>New cancer cases</td>
<td>Motor vehicle crash injuries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8,697</td>
<td>30,550</td>
<td>13,505</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• For example: each year in Ohio between 56,000 and 78,000 adult women experience physical intimate partner violence; in comparison, 51,007 adult women are injured in motor vehicle crashes.

How do different types of counties compare?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County type (# of counties)</th>
<th>Petitions for civil protection orders (per 10,000 adults)</th>
<th>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation in LTC facilities (per 100 resident beds)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Major metropolitan (6)</td>
<td>25.9</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban (18)</td>
<td>22.7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smaller metropolitan (7)</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appalachian (29)</td>
<td>28.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Appalachian rural (28)</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>State mean (88)</strong></td>
<td><strong>21.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.3</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Appalachian counties have a higher rate of petitions for civil protection orders (CPO’s).
• Major metropolitan counties have a higher rate of reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation in LTC facilities.
• Differences in data collection limit our ability to compare other indicators of family violence across counties.

Is family violence increasing?

It is hard to say. Some data sources suggest family violence is increasing; others suggest it is stable or decreasing. Within a location, changes over time are largely due to changes in victims’ ability to access services. This graph, for example, suggests a significant increase in petitions for CPO’s. This trend could reflect a growing awareness or ability of victims to request CPO’s. For a discussion of when differences are noteworthy, please see the introduction.

![Graph showing trends in petitions for civil protection orders, per 10,000 adults, Ohio, 2000-2008](image)

Mean annual rate of petitions for civil protection orders, per 10,000 adults, Ohio, 2000-2008

- 16.5 (2000-02)
- 20.1 (2003-05)
- 21.6 (2006-08)

To talk with someone about family violence, contact:
Child Abuse Hotline: 1-800-4-A-CHILD
Ohio Domestic Violence Network 1-800-934-9840
Ohio Area Agencies on Aging: 1-866-243-5678
Counties

http://www.hpio.net/OFVPP_CountyProfiles.html
Family Violence in Allen County

These data describe common types of violence perpetrated by family members or caregivers in our county each year. We present the best available, most recent estimates. Nonetheless, our figures are conservative and represent only part of the burden family violence places on our families and communities. All figures are estimates or annual averages.

Each year in our county...

350 – 530 children are abused or neglected
584 reports of abuse or neglect are filed with children’s services
230 children are placed in custody

800 – 1,000 adults are physically abused by a current or former intimate partner
170 people are arrested for intimate partner violence
166 people file petitions for civil protection orders
129 adults seek shelter in domestic violence shelters in the county

860 – 1,100 seniors in the community are abused, neglected or financially exploited
90 – 170 seniors in LTC facilities are abused, neglected or financially exploited
42 reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation are filed for seniors in the community
27 reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation are filed for seniors in LTC facilities

- It is difficult to measure the true prevalence of family violence; many victims never come to the attention of authorities.
- Reports to local children’s service agencies typically exceed the estimated number of abused or neglected children. This is likely due to multiple reports filed for a single child. Also, many children are placed in custody for reasons other than abuse or neglect (e.g., delinquency).
- Elder abuse/neglect figures exclude self-neglect and victims <60 years old. (LTC = long term care)

This profile is part of an 88-county series provided by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project – a collaborative project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health with support from the HealthPath Foundation of Ohio. For additional copies and a detailed description of how we calculated these figures, please visit: www.healthpolicyohio.org/OFVPP_CountyProfiles.html

Family Violence in Allen County

These data describe common types of violence perpetrated by family members or caregivers in our county each year. We present the best available, most recent estimates. Nonetheless, our figures are conservative and represent only part of the burden family violence places on our families and communities. All figures are estimates or annual averages.

Each year in our county...

- **350 – 530** children are abused or neglected
- **800 – 1,000** adults are physically abused by a current or former intimate partner
- **860 – 1,100** seniors in the community are abused, neglected or financially exploited
- **584** reports of abuse or neglect are filed with children’s services
- **170** people are arrested for intimate partner violence
- **90 – 170** seniors in LTC facilities are abused, neglected or financially exploited
- **584** reports of abuse or neglect are filed with children’s services
- **166** people file petitions for civil protection orders
- **42** reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation are filed for seniors in the community
- **230** children are placed in custody
- **129** adults seek shelter in domestic violence shelters in the county
- **27** reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation are filed for seniors in LTC facilities
- **170** people are arrested for intimate partner violence
- **42** reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation are filed for seniors in the community
- **166** people file petitions for civil protection orders
- **129** adults seek shelter in domestic violence shelters in the county

- It is difficult to measure the true prevalence of family violence; many victims never come to the attention of authorities.
- Reports to local children’s service agencies typically exceed the estimated number of abused or neglected children. This is likely due to multiple reports filed for a single child. Also, many children are placed in custody for reasons other than abuse or neglect (e.g., delinquency).
- Elder abuse/neglect figures exclude self-neglect and victims <60 years old. (LTC = long term care)

This profile is part of an 88-county series provided by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project – a collaborative project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health with support from the HealthPath Foundation of Ohio. For additional copies and a detailed description of how we calculated these figures, please visit: www.healthpolicyohio.org/OFVPP_CountyProfiles.html

In Allen County, how does family violence compare to other threats among ...?

**teenage girls** (age 15-19, est. #/year)

- Cigarette use: 640-1,100
- Dating violence: 310-460
- Pregnancies: 270
- Motor vehicle crash injuries: 125

**adult women** (age 18+, est. #/year)

- Physical intimate partner violence: 510-700
- Motor vehicle crash injuries: 565
- Mothers without 1st trimester prenatal care: 351
- New cancer cases: 290

**seniors** (age 60+, est. #/year)

- Injuries from falls: 630-1,200
- Elder abuse/neglect: 860-1,100
- New cancer cases: 372
- Motor vehicle crash injuries: 170

- For example: each year in our county between 510 and 700 adult women experience physical intimate partner violence; in comparison, 565 adult women are injured in motor vehicle crashes.

**How do we compare to other counties?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Allen County</th>
<th>Mean of 7 smaller metro counties</th>
<th>State mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Civil protection order petitions (per 10,000 adults)</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>21.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation in LTC facilities (per 100 resident beds)</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Allen County has about the same rate of petitions for civil protection orders (CPO’s) compared to similar counties in Ohio.
- Allen County has about the same rate of reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation in LTC facilities compared to similar counties in Ohio.
- Differences in data collection limit our ability to compare other indicators of family violence across counties.

**Is family violence increasing?**

It is hard to say. Some data sources suggest family violence is increasing; others suggest it is stable or decreasing. Within a county, changes over time are largely due to changes in victims' ability to access services. This graph, for example, suggests a significant increase in petitions for CPO’s in our county. This trend could reflect a growing awareness or ability of victims to request CPO’s. For a discussion of when differences are noteworthy, please see the introduction.

To talk with someone about family violence, contact:

- Child Abuse Hotline: 1-800-4-A-CHILD
- Ohio Domestic Violence Network: 1-800-934-9840
- Ohio Area Agencies on Aging: 1-866-243-5678
How do we compare to other counties?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Allen County</th>
<th>Mean of 7 smaller metro counties</th>
<th>State mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Civil protection order petitions (per 10,000 adults)</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>21.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation in LTC facilities (per 100 resident beds)</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Allen County has **about the same rate** of petitions for civil protection orders (CPO’s) compared to similar counties in Ohio.
- Allen County has **about the same rate** of reports of abuse, neglect or exploitation in LTC facilities compared to similar counties in Ohio.
- Differences in data collection limit our ability to compare other indicators of family violence across counties.
When are differences noteworthy?

• Apparent differences are often due to chance

• Calculate a range beyond which we are confident differences are (probably) not due to chance
  – “confidence interval”

• Fewer cases $\rightarrow$ larger confidence intervals
Is family violence increasing?

It is hard to say. Some data sources suggest family violence is increasing; others suggest it is stable or decreasing. Within a county, changes over time are largely due to changes in victims’ ability to access services. This graph, for example, suggests a significant increase in petitions for CPO’s in our county. This trend could reflect a growing awareness or ability of victims to request CPO’s. For a discussion of when differences are noteworthy, please see the introduction.

Mean annual rate of petitions for civil protection orders, per 10,000 adults, Allen County, 2000-2008
How Can I Use Data?
Ways of Using Data

- Planning
  - Use data to find an answer
- Evaluation
- Grant-Writing
  - Use data to support your answer
- Advocacy
Explaining County-Level Variation

1. Reporting procedures
2. Administrative differences
3. Organizational capacity
4. Underlying prevalence
Mean annual # (with 95% CI) of self-reported incidents of abuse/neglect in long term care facilities per 100 resident beds in 62 Ohio counties, 2006-2008

Source: Ohio Attorney General, Medicaid Fraud Control Unit; Ohio Department of Health
Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project, a project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health. 614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
Reported incidents of abuse/neglect in LTC facilities per 100 resident beds per year, 2006-2008

Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project
614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
Mean # of Adult Protective Service Cases per year (with 95% CI) per 1,000 residents 60+ in 88 Ohio counties, 2006-2008

Source: Ohio Attorney General, Medicaid Fraud Control Unit; Ohio Department of Health
Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project, a project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health. 614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
Association of APS report rates with % of children in poverty in 47 Ohio Counties, 2006-2008

Note: Includes counties with ≥100 cumulative reports, 2006-2008; APS reports exclude reports of self-neglect
Sources: ODJFS; US Census Bureau
Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project, a project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health. 614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
Annual average (with 95% CI)
of self-reported incidents of abuse/neglect in LTC facilities per 100 resident beds
in 7 counties in AAA 3, Ohio, 2006-2008

Source: Ohio Attorney General, Medicaid Fraud Control Unit
Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project, a project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio
and the Ohio State University College of Public Health.  614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
Ways of Using Data

• Planning
  Use data to find an answer

• Evaluation

• Grant-Writing
  Use data to support your answer

• Advocacy
Using data to show that FV in Ohio is…

• Common

• Consequential

• Changeable
## Available Research Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Child abuse &amp; neglect</th>
<th>Intimate partner violence</th>
<th>Elder abuse &amp; neglect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Common</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consequential</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changeable</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To show that FV is common…

• Emphasize past-year prevalence

• Emphasize local

• Case reports build credibility
Each year in Allen County…

• At least 860 seniors in the community are abused or neglected

• At least 90 seniors in long term care facilities are abused or neglected
To show that FV is common…

• Emphasize *past-year* prevalence

• Emphasize local

• Case reports build credibility

• Put in context of other problems
Selected threats to seniors’ health in Allen County:

Estimated number of cases per year among seniors age 60+

- Injuries from falls: 630-1,200
- Elder abuse/neglect: 860-1,100
- New cancer cases: 372
- Motor vehicle crash injuries: 170

Injuries from falls and elder abuse/neglect are based on survey samples and present a low and high estimate.
To show that FV is consequential...

• Association with other outcomes
  – illness & injury
  – disability
  – employment
  – homelessness
  – death

• Cost
  – agency burden
To show that FV is changeable…

• Highlight change over time

• Consider differences across place

• Cite intervention research
# petitions for civil protection orders per 10,000 residents:
Allen County vs. all smaller metro counties in Ohio, 2000-2008

Source: Supreme Court of Ohio
Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project, a project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health. 614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
Adult Protective Services Reports per 1,000 seniors by Area Agency on Aging, 2006 vs. 2008

Note: Report rates exclude reports of self-neglect
Source: ODJFS, US Census
Slide prepared by the Ohio Family Violence Prevention Project, a project of the Health Policy Institute of Ohio and the Ohio State University College of Public Health. 614.292.3373 ofvpp@cph.osu.edu
We need to acknowledge…

• FV is not equally common everywhere

• FV is not always getting worse

• Not all programs and policies work
Themes
Themes

• Each year, many victims of family violence never come to the attention of authorities.

• Certain types of family violence are every bit as common as other, more widely recognized threats to health and well-being.
Each year, many victims of family violence never come to the attention of authorities.

“According to a recent study, at least 380 elders are abused or neglected each year in Auglaize County, yet the local adult protective service agency only received 7 reports.”
Certain types of family violence are every bit as common as other, more widely recognized threats to health and well-being.

“One recent study estimated that each year in Hancock County, at least 570 seniors are abused or neglected – more than double the number of new cancer cases.”
Quoting A Range

• Can be confusing, unwieldy

• 3 options:
  – between
  – at least
  – as many as
• “...a recent study found that between 860 and 1,100 seniors are abused or neglected in our county each year.”

• “...a recent study found that at least 860 seniors are abused or neglected in our county each year.”

• “...a recent study found that as many as 1,100 seniors are abused or neglected in our county each year.”
A Plea and a Warning

• Know the details!

• Read the relevant parts of “Sources and Methods”

• Avoid undermining your work and the data
Questions/Comments

What if this makes my agency look bad?
Thank you